

The General Manager
Waverley Council
PO Box 9
Bondi Junction NSW 1355

Dear Sir / Madam

SUPPLEMENTARY HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT 94 CARRINGTON ROAD / 203-209 BRONTE ROAD / 223-227 BRONTE ROAD PLANNING PROPOSAL

1. Background

A Planning Proposal to amend the current height and floor space ratio controls of the *Waverley Local Environmental Plan 2012* ('the LEP') applicable to the above site, prepared by H & E Architects, is being submitted to Waverley Council, accompanied by a Revised Heritage Assessment prepared by John Oultram Heritage & Design in January 2019. GBA Heritage have been engaged to work with the architects and Mr Oultram to consult on design development and to and prepare this supplementary impact assessment.

Accordingly GBA Heritage concurs with Mr Oultram's assessment: the proposal will have an acceptable heritage impact.

2. Limitations

No historical summary, site description, heritage grading or description of the proposal is included herein, as these are provided in the Oultram report and concurred with. The following relevant points are noted:

- The only heritage listed building on the site is the Robin Hood Hotel, which is not proposed to be altered.
- The Charing Cross Heritage Conservation Area (the 'HCA') includes the west side of Bronte Road and the building at 223-227 Bronte Road (part of 94 Carrington Road).
- The latter building is considered in the inventory sheet for the HCA to be Contributory, due to its being over 50 years old.

GBA Heritage
Heritage Consultants

Level 1, 71 York Street
Sydney NSW 2000
Australia
T: +61 2 9299 8600
F: +61 2 9299 8711

gba@gbaheritage.com
www.gbaheritage.com

Nominated Architect
Graham Leslie Brooks
NSW Architects
Registration 3836

GBA Heritage Pty Ltd
Incorporated in NSW

ABN 56 073 802 730
ACN 073 802 730

2. Assessment of Impact

The assessment of impact by Mr Oultram is supported. In confirmation, impact assessment criteria proposed in the erstwhile Heritage Office's document *Statements of Heritage Impact* are addressed below.

The following aspects of the proposal respect or enhance the heritage significance of the item or conservation area for the following reasons:

- The heritage listed Robin Hood Hotel is to be retained.
- The Bronte Road facade of the Contributory building at 223-227 Bronte Road is to be retained.
- The proposed building envelope adjacent to the Hotel on Carrington Road will employ a podium matching the Hotel in height, with the additional storey set back from the street facade, thus respecting the heritage item.
- The structure south of the latter will be lower, providing a stepping down towards the south, where there are currently lower-scale buildings, respecting the character of the area.
- The proposal will continue the original residential/commercial use of the property at 94 Carrington Road (including 223-227 Bronte Road).
- The proposed connection between Bronte and Carrington Roads, and the commercial/recreational activation of that connection, will enhance the long-term viability of the commercial heart of the HCA and acknowledge, enlarge and enhance the remnant lane/passage network within and along the western edge of the HCA.
- The proposed building envelope at 223-227 Bronte Rd will be set back behind the retained Interwar facade, respecting the HCA.

Partial Demolition of a Building or Structure

- *Have all options for retention and adaptive re-use been explored?*
- *Can all of the significant elements of the heritage item be kept and any new development be located elsewhere on the site?*

No heritage building will be impacted. The rear apartments at the Contributory building at 223-227 Bronte Road are considered structurally unsound, and the shops do not meet contemporary market expectations; both would require extensive modification. Partial demolition is proposed. It is noted that the great bulk of the building is out of general public view, and that the visible facade on Bronte Road is to be retained.

New Development Adjacent to a Heritage Item

- *How is the impact of the new development on the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised?*
- *Is the new development sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (e.g. form, siting, proportions, design)?*
- *How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects?*
- *Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised?*
- *Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance?*

The height of the proposed envelopes along Carrington Road is handled in a manner respectful of the heritage listed Robin Hood Hotel, by use of a podium matching the Hotel height. These envelopes and those within the site will not generally be visible from the HCA. The building envelope at 223-227 Bronte Road will be lower than the telecommunication masts on the adjacent Leagues Club, and will continue the more urban massing characterising this northern section of the HCA. Sympathy with the character of the HCA is also achieved through retention of the facade at 223-227 Bronte Road.

No existing significant views of the heritage listed Robin Hood Hotel will be obstructed or adversely altered. The main potential impact on views within and from the HCA will be from the south along Bronte Road, where the

Figure 1
Architect's render of view along Bronte Road from south, showing retained facade of 223-227 Bronte Road and the proposed envelope, articulated into smaller-scale components relating to the lower adjacent buildings.



southern facade of the envelope at 223-227 Bronte Road will be partly visible. However, the transition to/from the lower scale of the shopping street can be managed through appropriate design resolution, for example by articulating the set-back facade into elements relating to the scale of the lower buildings along Bronte Road, and by appropriate use of materials. Use of clearly contemporary materiality and form, distinguishing and visually separating the new from the old is one way of respecting the existing character (some design principles are recommended below).

Given the uninterrupted views of the Hotel and retention of the facade at 223-227 Bronte Road, the public will continue to be able to view and appreciate the significance of the site.

3. Conclusions

- The introduction of a new, active laneway into this area of traditional laneways will enhance the Charing Cross Conservation Area and the vicinity in general.
- There will be no adverse impact on the significance of the heritage listed Robin Hood Hotel or any other heritage items in the vicinity.
- Retention of the facade of the Contributory building at 223-227 Bronte Road mitigates the impact of the removal of that building, most of which is structurally unsound and not generally visible from the public realm. Treatment of the retained facade will be subject to further design resolution.
- Significant existing views within and from the Conservation Area will generally be retained. Any impact on views north along Bronte Road to the south facade of the proposed envelope at 223-227 Bronte Road can be mitigated by appropriate design resolution.
- The conclusions in the report by John Oultram Heritage & Design are supported.

4. Recommendation

Council should have no hesitation in approving the Planning Proposal.

Heritage oriented principles for future design are included in an attachment to this letter.

Yours faithfully,
GBA HERITAGE

Dov Midalia
Senior Heritage Consultant
dovmidalia@gbaheritage.com

ATTACHMENT : DESIGN PRINCIPLES

The following are offered as heritage-related guiding principles for any appropriate future design for the site.

- The design style of all new structures on the site should be consistent.
- The use of contemporary forms and materials to distinguish new buildings clearly from old is considered acceptable, provided the overall design is also sympathetic to the relevant heritage items.
- In addition to using a 'podium' relating to the overall height of the Robin Hood Hotel, consideration should be given to picking up other primary horizontal lines of the Hotel in the facades of new buildings along Carrington Road.
- Consideration should also be given to including on the new facades materials sympathetic to those of the Hotel.
- The facade at 223-227 Bronte Road should be retained and conserved.
- The southern facade of any building at 223-227 Bronte Road should be designed so as to mitigate visual impact on northward views along Bronte Road and any tendency to visually dominate the lower-scale buildings south of the site. Such mitigation could be achieved through articulation of the facade into smaller-scale elements, for example dividing the facade horizontally into elements reflecting the scale of nearby buildings, and through making new elements clearly identifiable as new. The lines of the 'entablature' on the retained facade could be picked up in the new southern facade.